

CITY OF MUSKEGON
HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING
MINUTES

May 3, 2005

The meeting was called to order at 4:04 p.m. by Chair, J. Hilt.

MEMBERS PRESENT: J. Hilt, S. Kroes, T. Bosma, T. Russo, A. Brown S. Thompson

MEMBERS ABSENT: L. Spataro, excused.

STAFF PRESENT: J. Fitzpatrick, H. Griffith

OTHERS PRESENT:

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A motion to approve the regular meeting minutes of March 1, 2005 was made by T. Bosma, supported by S. Kroes and unanimously approved.

T. Russo arrived at 4:05 p.m.

NEW BUSINESS/PUBLIC HEARINGS

Case 2005-08 Request to replace window. Applicant: David Doyle; 59 Irwin; District: Clinton Peck. J. Fitzpatrick presented the staff report. City of Muskegon Inspections Department had noticed that work was being done on 59 Irwin without a building permit. Inspections notified the owner that they would need to get a permit as well as permission from the HDC. The owner had already removed the original window and replaced it with a new one. The original window was 4' 6" x 5' 6". The new window, which has already been installed is 4' x 5'. Staff recommends denial to replace the window with the current style but suggests that the HDC provide guidance to Mr. Doyle regarding what might be appropriate for the building. Review of the file for this property shows that windows have previously been altered. It does not appear that the window, which was replaced, was original to the building. The file also shows that the building is not a contributing structure in the district.

J. Hilt asked if the applicant had a design picked out for the future windows. J. Fitzpatrick stated that he didn't believe so since the applicant was looking for guidance in this issue. T. Bosma asked about the doors on the first floor. J. Fitzpatrick stated that they hadn't been replaced, it looked like the applicant had started painting in that area.

A motion to approve the request to replace the window at 59 Irwin with the condition that future window changes will match what he has already done, was made by S. Kroes, supported by T. Russo and unanimously approved.

Case 2005-09 Request to repair basement wall, addition of central air unit, building of garage, and building of deck. Applicant: Randall & Linda Drake; 1121 Peck; District: McLaughlin. J. Fitzpatrick presented the staff report. Applicants are requesting approval to repair the north basement wall of their home, addition of central air unit to the north side of the home, and construction of a garage and deck. Staff recommends approval of the request for repair of the basement wall and addition of central air conditioning unit, with appropriate screening. At this time there is not enough detail in the application to recommend either approval or denial for the deck or garage. Staff recommends that the owners resubmit applications with more detail.

R. Drake supplied the commission members with a drawing of a garage/carriage house, similar to what they would like to build. J. Hilt asked if it would be made of wood. R. Drake stated that it would not. L. Drake added that the reason is, in order to have it appear as in the drawings, they would have to use cedar, which wouldn't be able to be painted. They would like to paint it to match the home. T. Bosma asked about the basement. R. Drake explained what had happened to the basement wall, as well as what they would be doing to fix it. This would be contained to the one basement wall. L. Drake stated that they weren't sure they would be doing the deck at this time. She showed the commission members a picture of the brick pavers that are already used on the property. She would like to use them as a patio, until the funding is available for them to build the deck. They will be putting a hot tub on the pavers as well. The hot tub wouldn't be seen from the street. They would also like to possibly build some kind of screening for it. T. Bosma asked if hot tubs were addressed in the Historic District ordinance. J. Fitzpatrick stated that it didn't. H. Griffith added that the applicant would have to get a development permit for the hot tub.

A motion that the HDC approve the request to repair the north basement wall, addition of central air unit to the north side of the home, construction of a garage and brick pavers to 1121 Peck, was made by A. Brown, supported by T. Bosma and unanimously approved.

Case #2005-10 Request to replace sign; Applicant: Muskegon Pregnancy Services; 1319 Peck; District: McLaughlin. J. Fitzpatrick presented the staff report. The sign at 1319 Peck had been damaged and they are requesting approval of a new sign. A general sketch and description of the sign was provided to the commission members. The style seems to be consistent with other signs in the area. Staff recommends approval of the request contingent with approval from the City of Muskegon Code Coordinator.

J. Hilt asked if they would be painting the sign white. The applicant stated that it would be. S. Thompson asked if the sign would be constructed of wood. The applicant stated that it would be made of resin because it is smother and easier to paint.

A motion that the HDC approve the request to replace the sign at 1319 Peck, was made by T. Bosma, supported by A. Brown, and unanimously approved.

Case #2005-11 Request to approve the conceptual design of a front porch; Applicant: Scott Sieradzki; 557 W Clay.; District: Clay-Western. J. Fitzpatrick presented the staff report. The applicant wishes to get the HDC's approval for the conceptual design for the front porch at 557 W. Clay. He would also like to update the HDC on his progress. Due to the court proceedings, he hasn't been able to obtain a permit to finish the basement. A drawing was supplied to the commission members. Staff recommends approval of the concept. Mr. Sieradzki has been informed that he will need to come back to the HDC for final approval before he may begin construction of the porch.

The commission members discussed the conceptual design and were in favor of it. No motion was made on this.

Case #2005-12 Request to install door, new siding, lighting, and a sign; Applicant: Robert Lamson; 1735 Peck; District: Clinton-Peck. J. Fitzpatrick presented the staff report. The applicant wishes to install a new door, siding, lighting, and a sign along with some other cosmetic changes to the front of his building. Pictures of the building as it exists and the proposed changes were provided to the commission members. Staff recommends approval of the request to replace the door, siding, and lighting as proposed. Currently the building is classified as a non-contributing structure in the district. Proposed changes appear to help the building better fit into its surroundings without creating a false sense of history. Staff recommends approval of the sign contingent upon following the historic district guidelines and the City of Muskegon sign ordinance.

A motion the HDC approve the request to replace the door, new siding, new lighting, a sign, and other cosmetic changes to the front of 1735 Peck, was made by S. Thompson, supported by S. Kroes and unanimously approved.

Case #2005-13 Request to repair spalling brick, repaint the building, and erect ornate barricades over the utility meters; Applicant: Double L Properties LLC; 563-565 W. Western; District: Clay-Western. J. Fitzpatrick presented the staff report. Work has begun on this project without HDC approval. The applicant wishes to repair spalling brick, repaint the building, and erect ornate barricades over the utility meters. This was a last minute addition to the agenda and the applicant had not provided any specific details, but they will have them at the meeting. Some of the work which has already been performed goes against the Secretary of the Interior's guidelines.

M. Johnson described the damage that had been done to the exterior brick. He has a masonry contractor to fix the brick. Once that is done, he will be repainting and replacing the windows. T. Bosma stated that the softer brick would be replaced with a harder brick. The harder brick can be waterproofed. He also felt the building would look fine without the quarterling. A. Brown asked what the barricade around the meters would be constructed of. M. Johnson stated that he wasn't sure. He would like to hide the meters since they are right next to their door. The meters would also need to be accessible to the meter readers. He suggested a fence type style that would open.

A motion that the HDC approve the request to repair spalling brick, the corbelling doesn't need to be replaced, and erect barricades over utility meters that would blend in with the rest of the building at 563-565 W. Western was made by A. Brown, supported by A. Kroes and approved with T. Bosma voting nay.

WALK ON

Case #2005-14 Request to install fence around adjacent vacant lot; Applicant: Susan Kroes; 1563 Jefferson; District: Jefferson. S. Kroes supplied the commission members with pictures of her current fence. She would like to continue with the same fence along the adjacent vacant lot that she purchased.

A motion that the HDC approve the request to add on to the fence already in place, with matching materials, to 1563 Jefferson, was made by A. Brown, supported by T. Russo and approved with S. Thompson voting nay and S. Kroes abstaining.

OLD BUSINESS

Case #2005-07 Request to demolish the garage; Applicant: Marie Anderson; 1305 Jefferson; District: Campus. J. Fitzpatrick presented the staff report. The applicant had previously submitted an application for demolition of the garage, but had not provided any detail. The applicant has now provided pictures of the garage which illustrates its condition. The pictures were provided to the commission members. Staff recommends approval of the request to demolish. Although, the guidelines recommend against demolition, it appears that there is significant damage to the existing structure.

S. Thompson asked if the garage was attached to the home. T. Bosma stated that it is at the corner. If the garage is demolished, the adjacent portion of the home would have to be repaired.

A motion that the HDC approve the request to demolish the garage at 1305 Jefferson with the condition that the repairs to the home will match what is there, was made by A. Brown, supported by T. Bosma and unanimously approved.

OTHER

Request for input on potential construction of carport; 1135 Fifth Street. J. Fitzpatrick presented the staff report. The current owner is seeking to sell the home located at 1135 Fifth Street but one potential purchaser would like to add a carport. Staff informed the listing realtor that it could not offer a recommendation without seeing specific plans, but that the structure is located in an AA district, and the addition of a carport would be a significant change. The current owner would like the commission input on the potential for adding a carport.

T. Bosma stated that the State allows for something to be built that isn't historic in a AA district. Whatever is done, it should look complementary but not create a false sense of

history. The State wants it to be obvious that it is not original to the structure. The commission members concurred that they would need some kind of plan in order to make a decision on this.

Christmas Decorations – J. Hilt stated that the decorations had been removed on May 1st. She stated that Mr. Thompson was waiting for an update on this.

Boiler Works – J. Fitzpatrick updated the commission members. L. Spataro brought it to staff's attention that the Boiler Works was having some windows bricked up that weren't approved by the HDC. He has contacted Mr. Jacobsen of HDC construction. Joel will be going thru the application and see what was approved and not approved. He wanted the commission members to be aware that staff is looking into this. L. Spataro also questioned the color of brick being used. After review of the application it appears that the HDC did approve the use of an "alternate color brick."

ADJOURN

The meeting was adjourned at 5:00 p.m. by J. Hilt.

hmg